

# When Aliyev's MPs were shown the door

A historic PACE debate Strasbourg, 24 January 2024



Frank Schwabe challenging credentials – Azerbaijani delegation leaving PACE

#### **Protagonists**

MAKING HISTORY – PACE WINTER SESSION 2024
FRANK SCHWABE ON MONDAY, 22 JANUARY
MOGENS JENSEN ON WEDNESDAY, 24 JANUARY
INGJERD SCHOU
PAUL GAVAN
INGJERD SCHOU 9   PAUL GAVAN 10   FRANK SCHWABE 11   DAVOR IVO STIER 12
DAVOR IVO STIER
OLEKSII GONCHARENKO
BJARNI JONSSON
YVES CRUCHTEN
FRANCOIS BONNEAU 16
ZEYNEP YILDIZ17
MOGENS JENSEN
THEODOROS KOUSOPOULOS
WHO VOTED HOW?
THOSE WHO VOTED ON 24 JANUARY: ON AZERBAIJAN'S BLACKLIST?
DLEKSII GONCHARENKO13BJARNI JONSSON14YVES CRUCHTEN15FRANÇOIS BONNEAU16ZEYNEP YILDIZ17MOGENS JENSEN18THEODOROS ROUSOPOULOS19WHO VOTED HOW?20

#### In short

On 22 January 2024, the credentials are challenged.

On 23 January, two committees look at the challenge. The Monitoring Committee produces a report: <u>"Challenge, on substantive grounds, of the still unratified credentials of the parliamentary delegation of Azerbaijan"</u>

On 24 January, the plenary debate and vote take place on a resolution, based on this report: <u>"Challenge, on substantive grounds, of the still unratified credentials of the parliamentary</u> <u>delegation of Azerbaijan"</u>

All documents on this debate are here.

Transcript of the full debate

2

#### Making history – PACE winter session 2024

On the opening morning of the first day of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe's (PACE) first part session of 2024, Frank Schwabe, a German Social Democrat, stood up to present a motion to "challenge the still unratified credentials of the delegation of Azerbaijan on substantive grounds". He was urging his colleagues to suspend the participation of Azerbaijani parliamentarians in the Assembly on account of a "serious violation of the basic principles of the Council of Europe."

#### Video of Frank Schwabe challenging the credentials

It was a bold move, leading to a historic debate.

Since its first meeting in August 1949, the Assembly has imposed sanctions just four times. The first two occasions followed coup d'etats – in Greece in 1967 (resulting in the suspension of the Greek delegation in 1969) and in Turkey in 1980 (resulting in the suspension of the Turkish delegation in 1981). Both delegations were excluded from the work of the Assembly.

Since 1990, on two occasions the credentials of the Russian delegation *were* ratified with restrictions. In April 2000, at the height of the second Chechen war, the Russian delegation was stripped of its *voting* rights but remained in the Assembly. The same happened in 2014, following Russia's annexation of Crimea. In January 2015, the Russian delegation walked out and refused to present its credentials again until 2019. In the following years, the Russian delegation's credentials were always ratified, as a 2019 resolution explained:

"The Parliamentary Assembly constitutes the most important pan-European platform where political dialogue on the Russian Federation's obligations under the Statute of the Council of Europe can take place ... Consequently, the Assembly resolves to ratify the credentials of the Russian delegation."<sup>1</sup>

One month before Russia's full-scale invasion of Ukraine in February 2022, as troops were brought to its borders, PACE was still ratifying the Russian credentials.

Two times, challenges of the credentials were tried and failed. In 2009, the Russian delegation survived a challenge in the wake of its invasion of Georgia the previous year. In 2006, a challenge to Azerbaijan's credentials, following deeply flawed elections in November 2005, also failed. Tony Lloyd, the UK parliamentarian appointed to examine the challenge, observed:

"The latest parliamentary elections in Azerbaijan sadly follow the same line as all the previous ballots since the country's accession – they failed to meet Council of Europe standards. This clearly presents a situation falling under the provisions of rule 8.2.b. – "persistent failure to honour obligations and commitments", a situation that cannot be tolerated any further.<sup>2</sup>

The argument of the authorities and of our Azeri parliamentary colleagues that despite the shortcomings these elections have been the most democratic in the recent history of the country cannot be accepted as an excuse.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> 22 Jan 2024 - 1 st sitting - PACE winter session, Min 28.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The challenge of still unratified credentials of the parliamentary delegation of Azerbaijan on substantial grounds (coe.int), 2006.

Neither can we agree with the justification of mass violations based on alleged cultural differences and on the fact that mentalities cannot be changed overnight ... The Assembly cannot tolerate a situation where the elected representatives of the Azeri people lack the democratic credentials of a substantial part of their own population and where, because of this, the entire democratic process is undermined."

A majority in the Assembly rejected this, with 100 voting to ratify the Azerbaijan' delegation's credentials and 67 voting against. We now know that in 2006, the Assembly was already in thrall to Azerbaijan's caviar diplomacy. This changed in 2017 (more on this: https://www.esiweb.org/proposals/caviar-diplomacy)

As the debate in January 2024 made obvious, it is no longer the case.

#### Frank Schwabe on Monday, 22 January

"Dear President, under Article 8, I challenge the still unratified credentials of the delegation of Azerbaijan on substantive grounds."



Schwabe (born 1970) has served in the German Bundestag since 2005 as a member of the Social Democrats from North Rhine-Westphalia. He is presently spokesperson for human rights and humanitarian aid of the SPD parliamentary group. Since 2018, he has served as the chair of the Socialists, Democrats and Greens Group of the Council of Europe, and since 2022 as chair of the German PACE delegation.

"Dear President, under Article 8, I challenge the still unratified credentials of the delegation of Azerbaijan on substantive grounds.

Unfortunately, I see no other chance than to send this clear and unmistakable signal now.

There's not only a dramatic escalation in domestic politics with more and more political prisoners. There's not only the violent displacement of more than 100 000 people in Karabakh, Nagorno-Karabakh. There is a direct responsibility of the Azerbaijani delegation for the fact that our rapporteurs were unable to visit the Lachin Corridor or political prisoners at least three times in 2023. The negative highlight, however, is the non-invitation of the Council of Europe to the early elections now for president on the 7 September."

#### Mogens Jensen on Wednesday, 24 January

"Unfortunately, more than 20 years after joining the Council of Europe, Azerbaijan has still not fulfilled major commitments stemming from its membership of our organisation."



Jensen (born 1963) has served in the Danish Folketing (parliament) since 2005 as a member of the Social Democrats from West Jutland. He currently serves as the chair of the Danish PACE delegation and as PACE's General Rapporteur on media freedom and safety of journalists.

"Mister President, Dear colleagues,

On Monday here in the Assembly chamber, our colleague Mr Frank Schwabe, along with more than 30 members of the Assembly, challenged the still unratified credentials of the Azerbaijani delegation on substantive grounds, on the basis of Article 8 of the Rules of Procedure of our Assembly. He cited, among other things, political prisoners in the country, the violent displacement of people from Nagorno-Karabakh, cases of lack of co-operation with the Assembly's rapporteurs, and the lack of an invitation to the Assembly to observe the country's 7 February presidential election ...

In acceding to the Council of Europe on 25 January 2001, the Republic of Azerbaijan has agreed to honour several specific commitments which are listed in the Assembly resolution and has accepted the obligations incumbent on all member states under Article 3 of the Statutes of the Council of Europe, compliance with the principles of pluralist democracy and the rule of law, as well as respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms of all persons placed under its jurisdiction.<sup>3</sup>

<sup>3</sup> 

<sup>&</sup>quot;Several specific commitments": this refers to 29 commitments made by Azerbaijan during its application for membership in the Council of Europe. It included the ratification of conventions, commitments on peacefully solving the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict, commitments to adopt various domestic laws for the upholding of rule of law and democratic norms, commitments for human rights and commitments for the Council of Europe to monitor progress.

Article 3 of the Statutes of the Council of Europe: "Every member of the Council of Europe must accept the principles of the rule of law and of the enjoyment by all persons within its jurisdiction of human rights and fundamental freedoms, and collaborate sincerely and effectively in the realisation of the aim of the Council as specified in Chapter I."

Unfortunately, more than 20 years after joining the Council of Europe, Azerbaijan has still not fulfilled major commitments stemming from its membership of our organization ...

In particular, the issue of the numerous political prisoners has not been resolved although it was already problematic at the time of the country's accession to the Council of Europe. According to credible NGO reports as of 1 December 2023, there were 254 political prisoners in Azerbaijan. Therefore, the systemic issue of using criminal prosecution against government critics has not been resolved despite the Assembly's resolution on reported cases of political prisoners in Azerbaijan of January 2020.

Moreover, this evening our Chamber will debate a report of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights on allegations of systemic torture and inhuman and degrading treatment or punishment in places of detention in Europe, which refers to some shocking cases of torture by law enforcement authorities in Azerbaijan ...<sup>4</sup>

For me, also as the Assembly's general rapporteur on media freedom and the safety of journalists, this particular concern about the increased number of violations of freedom of expression illustrated namely by the recent wave of arrests of journalists from the independent Abzas Media outlet.

It started with the arrest of Mr. Ulvi Hasanli and two of his collaborators on 20 and 21 November.<sup>5</sup> In January, two other Abzas journalists, Ms Nargiz Absalamova and Ms Elnara Gasimova, as well as Mr Hafiz Babali, the financial editor of the news agency, were arrested and placed in pre-trial detention in connection with the Abzas case. The same is the case for five other journalists ...

To conclude, all these issues cast serious doubt as to the compliance of the Republic of Azerbaijan with its commitments and obligations to the Council of Europe. Under the rules, the Assembly must vote for one of three options: to ratify the credentials, not to ratify them, or to ratify them together with depriving or suspending the exercise of some of the rights of participation or representation of members of the delegation ...

The gravity of human rights violations and the non-observance of basic principles of pluralist democracy and the rule of law convinced me that the sanctions for such serious and long lasting disrespect for the country's and statutory obligations cannot be symbolic.

PACE's report on torture notes about Azerbaijan: "... it has been reported that in the context of the 'Terter cases' (torture of a group of military personnel and civilians by the Azerbaijani military), many of those detained in 2017 were subjected to torture and inhumane treatment, with 11 confirmed deaths as a result of that torture. Detainees were tortured with the purpose of extracting confessions of treason. The Assembly is appalled by the horrendous methods of torture reported: electric shocks, pulling out nails, waterboarding, blindfolding, removal of genitals, rape, threats of rape of family members, among others. While some of those detained and originally convicted have now been acquitted and released, others remain in prison ... Separate to the 'Terter cases', some reports indicate that torture and other forms of ill-treatment have been used against members of the political opposition, journalists and human rights defenders."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Ulvi Hasanli is the director of the independent online media outlet *'Abzas Media'* since 2016. He was arrested on 20 November 2023. He is currently being held in pre-trial detention on charges of "conspiring to bring money into the country unlawfully." The charge carries up to an eight year sentence.

The sighted cases of non-co-operation with the Assembly only can reinforce this conviction. Therefore, the conclusion of the Monitoring Committee is that the Assembly should not ratify the credentials of the Azerbaijani delegation ...

I think it is important ... to leave the door open, of course, for the Azerbaijani delegation in case there is an improvement regarding the countries compliance with the basic principles of the Council of Europe and the obligations and commitments stemming from its membership of our organisation, as well as its co-operation with the Assembly."

#### **Ingjerd Schou**

"The conclusion of the Monitoring Committee, based on the facts presented in the report, is a proposal not to ratify the credentials of the delegation from Azerbaijan."



Schou (born 1955) has served in the Norwegian Storting since 2001 as a member of the Conservative Party from Ostfold. She has twice served as the vice-president of the Storting, and was the Minister of Social Affairs between 2001 and 2004. Since 2013, she has been the chair of the Norwegian PACE delegation. She wrote PACE's opinion on expelling Russia in 2022. She was the rapporteur for the PACE Rules committees opinion on the 'Challenge, on substantive grounds, of the still unratified credentials of the parliamentary delegation of Azerbaijan.'

"Depriving the right of a parliamentary delegation to partake in our work is serious business.

The report of Mr Mogens JENSEN and the Monitoring Committee details the grounds for the challenge which Mr Frank SCHWABE presented in the plenary on Monday, 22 January 2024, which rule 8.2 requires.<sup>6</sup> The grounds are:

- Serious violations of our basic principles.

- Persistent failure to honour obligations and commitments and lack of co-operation in our monitoring procedure.

Adopting the resolution means that Azerbaijan cannot participate in any work at our Assembly until new credentials are presented in January 2025. This [is] unless a new parliament is elected and [they] present their credentials in the meantime."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> "Rule 8.2" of PACE's 'Rules of Procedure' states: "The substantive grounds on which credentials may be challenged are a) a serious violation of the basic principles of the Council of Europe mentioned in Article 3 of, and the Preamble to, the Statute (The preamble states: 'Reaffirming their devotion to the spiritual and moral values which are the common heritage of their peoples and the true source of individual freedom, political liberty and the rule of law, principles which form the basis of all genuine democracy'. to, the Statute; Article 3 states: members'...must accept the principles of the rule of law and of the enjoyment by all persons within its jurisdiction of human rights and fundamental freedoms...').b). persistent failure to honour obligations and commitments and lack of co-operation in the Assembly's monitoring procedure."

#### Paul Gavan

"On behalf of the Group of the Unified European Left, I want to endorse the recommendation not to ratify the credentials of the Azerbaijan delegation."



Gavan (born 1965) has served in the Irish senate since 2016 as a member of Sinn Fein. He was previously PACE's rapporteur for the humanitarian consequences of the conflict between Armenia and Azerbaijan as well as Rapporteur on the status of the Lachin Corridor, which connects Armenia and the Nagorno Karabakh region. He is on the Bureau of the Group of the Unified European Left in PACE.

"On behalf of the Group of the Unified European Left, I want to endorse the recommendation not to ratify the credentials of the Azerbaijan delegation.

This is undoubtedly a sad day for the Assembly. It is never good to lose the representation of a member state, but it is an absolutely necessary action ...

The Azerbaijani government has consistently displayed a flagrant disregard for the key principles of the Council of Europe. The resolution lists numerous reports in this Assembly that have detailed concerns across several areas of human rights.

Now, I listen carefully today to the speech of Mr Samad SEYIDOV, the leader of the Azerbaijan delegation. He spoke outside of the hemicycle today at 3:00 p.m. He spoke of an orchestrated smear campaign against his country, and he made charges of political corruption and ethnic and religious hatred, and accused member states of attempting to unduly interfere with the ongoing electoral process in Azerbaijan ... At no point did Mr Samad SEYIDOV attempt to deal with any of the issues set out in this resolution, and I am afraid to say, that is indeed very telling ...

Azerbaijan will feature heavily in a report that we will debate later this evening on systemic torture and inhuman or degrading treatment and punishment. The details of these acts of torture and murder are truly horrifying, and an affront to all that this institution should stand for."

#### Frank Schwabe

"But unfortunately, he is imprisoned. For nothing – just for speaking the truth – for speaking about the situation in Azerbaijan around corruption in the political sphere. And he is not alone. They are more than 200 ..."



"Professor Doctor Gubad Ibadoghlu is a professor, a very well recognised professor from Azerbaijan. He should be professor at the university in Dresden just now. He is someone who is credible, who works and who works for the best of his own country, Azerbaijan.

But unfortunately, he is imprisoned. For nothing - just for speaking the truth - for speaking about the situation in Azerbaijan around corruption in the political sphere. And he is not alone. They are more than 200. I stopped counting them because it looks like that every day, every week, we have more and more political prisoners.

He's one of the political prisoners in Azerbaijan. It's a shame that in this year, in this organisation, we have a member country with political prisoners.

We are before an election and everybody knows the result of the election already; Wednesday 7 February 2024. We know the result of the election. These elections don't fulfil the minimum criteria of democratic elections, and the one before was the same, and before and before and before. It's always the same ...

We appoint rapporteurs, we decide about reports. We need free access to the member country. We have the obligation to send an election observation mission. The country has the obligation to invite us, and the obligation is the obligation from the parliament represented by the delegation in this Parliamentary Assembly ...

How will it end when a country can decide which observation they like, from which organisation they like – which observation mission, which rapporteur they like, which report they like, and they choose one or another. This [leads] to nowhere. If we let it happen with Azerbaijan, and it happened more and more and more, then in the end it will happen with all the member countries.

So we have an obligation [not just] towards the democratic situation of human rights and rule of law in Azerbaijan, but for the whole organisation."

#### **Davor Ivo Stier**

"We are in this situation due to the decisions taken by the authorities in Baku."



Stier (born 1972) has served in the Croatian parliament since 2011 as a member of the Croatian Democratic Union. He has previously served as the Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of European and Foreign Affairs. Since January 2024, he has served as the chair of the Group of the European People's Party, the largest group in PACE.

"When I was selected chair of the Group of the European People's Party group a few days ago, I did not imagine that my first intervention would be about not ratifying the credentials of a national delegation.

I believe that nobody here was looking forward to this situation ...

We are in this situation due to the decisions taken by the authorities in Baku. To disregard all the signals that were sent by this Assembly, not fulfilling the obligations of every member state in the Council of Europe and of every delegation in this Assembly.

There were many signals.

Now make no mistake about it: Azerbaijan is not expelled from the Council of Europe. Let's also make very clear that we look forward to the fulfilment of the criteria by Azerbaijan and therefore resuming the activities of the Azeri delegation in the Parliamentary Assembly in accordance with the rules of procedure as we have specified also in this Amendment that we tabled yesterday.

So to sum up, the doors continue to be open. The obligations remain also there; they need to be fulfilled."

#### Oleksii Goncharenko

"Azerbaijan became a member of this organisation in 2001. Did the situation really get so much worse just now than it was? I don't think so..."



Goncharenko (born 1980) has served in the Ukrainian Verkhovna Rada since 2014 as a member of the European Solidarity faction. Since 2024, he has served as the chairperson of PACE's Committee on Migration, Refugees and Displaced Persons.

"It is really a very sad moment for me and I think for many of my colleagues. Nothing good is happening right now. We just need to acknowledge this and to understand this ...

We need to remember this. One more question. Is it making us stronger? No, I don't believe so ...

Azerbaijan became a member of this organisation in 2001. Did the situation really get so much worse just now than it was? I don't think so ...

Also, I want to address the people of Azerbaijan. You belong to a free world. We want to see you here. That's very important. We want to fight for every nation which wants to be a part of the free world. That's very important for us. Please, let us forget about emotions, I urge both our Assembly and Azerbaijan to make steps towards one another to make the right decisions and to move ahead in building a better world, a more peaceful world, on the basis of our common values and that is really, very important.

Long live Azerbaijan! [in Azeri]

Long live Europe! [in French]"

#### **Bjarni Jonsson**

"...this institution, the Council of Europe, our Assembly, is choosing between Azerbaijan's credentials and its own."



Jonsson (born 1966) has served in the Icelandic Althing since 2017 as a member of the Left-Green Movement from Northwestern Iceland. Since January 2024 he has served as the vice president of the Alliance of Liberals and Democrats for Europe, the third largest group at PACE.

"Today this institution, the Council of Europe, our Assembly, is choosing between Azerbaijan's credentials and its own.

Because if we allow ourselves to be separated from our rules, our obligations, our commitments to protecting human rights in our own member states, we collectively undermine and lose all credibility.

Some say - and rightly - that we need to continue the dialogue. This is not the end of a dialogue with Azerbaijan. It is the beginning of a firm dialogue which we all want to see producing effective research for the good of our institution and the people of Azerbaijan ... We need to hold all member states to the same standards, small or large.

Our European democracies are not established once and for all. We need to strive to uphold them each and every day, continuously, in all parts of our continent ...

We have had a dramatic escalation in domestic politics with more and more political prisoners, the violent displacement of more than 100,000 people in Nagorno Karabakh, the lack of co-operation with our Assembly rapporteurs, as well as the non-invitation to the Assembly to observe the early presidential elections.

#### **Yves Cruchten**

"...it is absolutely necessary for the credibility of this Assembly to take action today, even if it is a sad move that nobody really enjoys taking."



Cruchten (born 1975) has served in the Luxembourg Chamber of Deputies since 2013 as a member of the Luxembourg Socialist Workers' Party. He was previously a member of the Luxembourgish delegation from 2014 to 2019, and returned to PACE in 2024, serving as the Vice Chairman of the Group of Socialists, Democrats and Greens.

"As you know, I've been away here from this Assembly for five years now. I'm coming back, and I'm coming to the news that time travel is actually possible, because I feel [we have] turned back to the year 2013 or 2018. We deal today with the exact same problems with Azerbaijan as 10 years ago ...

Therefore it is to me crystal clear that no progress was made, absolutely none by Azerbaijan in all those years and they also don't give the impression that they are willing to improve the situation, on the contrary ...

Yes, it is absolutely necessary for the credibility of this Assembly to take action today, even if it is a sad move that nobody really enjoys taking. Please, vote for this Resolution and let's tell our colleagues from Azerbaijan that we are not just a happy gathering of some European parliamentarians, but that we take our commitment seriously when it comes to human rights, when it comes to rule of law and democracy.

Human rights defenders, journalists, NGOs in Azerbaijan cannot operate freely. Prisons are filling with political prisoners, elections don't meet our standards. The Council of Europe cannot turn a blind eye on this anymore. Our door stays open, but things have to change in Azerbaijan for the better."

#### François Bonneau

"I believe we must maintain channels for dialogue, and hope that this warning shot will lead Azerbaijan to reconsider its positions and practices."



Bonneau (born 1953) is a member of the French Senate and has served as the President of the Regional Council of Centre-Val de Loire for the Union of the Right and Center since 2007. He has been a member of PACE since 2023.

"Every member state that joins the Council of Europe undertakes to respect a certain number of rules and duties. This is sometimes difficult and demanding, but it is necessary ...

On several occasions, our Assembly has adopted resolutions underlining the scale of the challenges to be met if the values of the Council of Europe are to be respected, whether in the fight against corruption, respect for the rights of LGBTI people, restrictions on the activities of associations or the freedom of journalists, while 18 journalists and media players are currently in detention ...

Azerbaijan is one of the countries of the Organisation with the highest number of unexecuted [European Court of Human Rights] judgments. More than 120 Court judgments against Azerbaijan have not yet been executed, or have been only partially executed.

The values of the European Convention on Human Rights are elements that we must share as a whole; they are not à la carte commitments ...

On the other hand, I believe we must maintain channels for dialogue, and hope that this warning shot will lead Azerbaijan to reconsider its positions and practices."

#### Zeynep Yildiz

"...the Council of Europe would be incomplete in the absence of Azerbaijan"



*Yildiz (born 1992) has served in the Turkish Grand National Assembly since 2018 as a member of the Justice and Development Party from Ankara.* 

"Here, in this Assembly, maybe we do not share the same ideas. Of course, we do not have identical stances on each and every issue. However, the major point that brings us together is to have a medium for dialogue. We see this place as a centre of conflict resolution, and moreover, as a medium that reinforces collaboration ...

In the context of multilateralism of this medium, Azerbaijan's presence here is one of the hallmarks that distinguishes this institution from the European Union and other international organisations. Azerbaijan's absence here will both dysfunctionalise the pluralistic nature of the founding philosophy of this Assembly and eradicate the aim of conflict resolution ...

... Azerbaijan is one of the indispensable members of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe for preserving PACE's pluralistic structure and that the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe would be incomplete in the absence of Azerbaijan."

#### **Mogens Jensen**

"There are 254 political prisoners and a huge number of journalists being in detention. And lately, 11 in a row have been sent to detention for having critical views on the developments in Azerbaijan. I think these numbers speak for themselves."



"I think Mr Paul GAVAN said it quite clearly and shortly. Yes, this is sad. It is sad that we – for one year – will miss the Azerbaijan delegation in our Assembly, but it is necessary. And, I think, just a few numbers from my report again underline this. I have counted at least during the last years, 14 resolutions where Azerbaijan is mentioned on violating all three fundamental values of our Assembly: democracy, rule of law, and human rights.

And the number of political prisoners itself tells us how serious this is. There are 254 political prisoners and a huge number of journalists being in detention. And lately, 11 in a row have been sent to detention for having critical views on the developments in Azerbaijan. I think these numbers speak for themselves.

Ms Zeynep YILDIZ said there should be a platform for dialogue. Yes, for sure. That's why we're here, to have dialogue on promoting the core values of our Assembly: rule of law, democracy, and human rights. But of course, it is necessary to have dialogue here that we then respect the values on which we went into this organisation as countries. We are here to promote rule of law, democracy, and human rights. And not in our countries disrespect the values that this organisation stands for.

But Mr Davor Ivo STIER also said something very important. It is: Azerbaijan is not expelled from the Council of Europe. They still are here. They can speak in the Council of Ministers. They are still a part of this organisation. And what also more have said, Mr Frank SCHWABE said it, is that the door is open, we have left the door open for the delegation to come back, and they have all opportunities to come back, they just have to act in accordance with the values of our organisations. So, I hope that is what will happen, that the Azerbaijan delegation will find their way back to our Assembly. They know what to do."

#### **Theodoros Rousopoulos**

"The draft Resolution in Document 15898 as amended is adopted, therefore the credentials of the delegation of Azerbaijan are not ratified."



Rousopoulos (born 1963) has served in the Hellenic parliament since 2005 as a member of New Democracy from Athens. He previously served as Minister of State and Government Spokesman. Between 2022 and 2024, he served as the chair of PACE's Committee on Migration, Refugees and Displaced Persons. Since 2024, he has served as the President of PACE.

"We now proceed to vote on the draft Resolution contained in Document 15898 as amended.

A simple majority is required. I remind you that if adopted, the credentials of the delegation of Azerbaijan will not be ratified.

If the draft Resolution is rejected, the credentials of the delegation of Azerbaijan will be ratified.

The vote is now open.

The vote is closed.

I call for the result to be displayed: Yes, so the result is:

We have 90 votes, 76 in favour, 10 against, 4 abstentions.

## The draft Resolution in Document 15898 as amended is adopted, therefore the credentials of the delegation of Azerbaijan are not ratified.

## Who voted how?

# How members voted

# 76 in favor, 10 against, 4 abstentions

Voting choice	Member	<b>Country</b>
In favour	Ms Nerea AHEDO	Spain
<mark>Against</mark>	Mr Mehmet AKALIN	<mark>Türkiye</mark>
<mark>Against</mark>	Mr Abdurrahman BABACAN	<mark>Türkiye</mark>
In favour	Ms Petra BAYR	Austria
In favour	Ms Marianne BINDER-KELLER	Switzerland
In favour	Mr Jone BLIKRA	Norway
In favour	Mr François BONNEAU	France
In favour	Mr Bertrand BOUYX	France
In favour	Ms Karin BROUWERS	Belgium
Abstention	Mr Roland Rino BÜCHEL	Switzerland
In favour	Mr Iulian BULAI	Romania
<b>Against</b>	Mr Mustafa CANBEY	<mark>Türkiye</mark>
In favour	Mr Nuno CARVALHO	Portugal
In favour	Ms Laura CASTEL	Spain
In favour	Mr Pedro CEGONHO	Portugal
<b>Against</b>	Ms Sena Nur ÇELİK KANAT	<mark>Türkiye</mark>
Abstention	Ms Lise CHRISTOFFERSEN	Norway
In favour	Ms Bernadeta COMA	Andorra
In favour	Mr Titus CORLĂŢEAN	Romania
Abstention	Mr Damien COTTIER	Switzerland
In favour	Mr Yves CRUCHTEN	Luxembourg
In favour	Ms Sabina ĆUDIĆ	Bosnia-Herzegovina
In favour	Mr Randolph DE BATTISTA	Malta
In favour	Mr Adnan DIBRANI	Sweden
In favour	Ms Heike ENGELHARDT	Germany
In favour	Mr Franz Leonhard ESSL	Austria
In favour	Ms Camilla FABRICIUS	Denmark
In favour	Mr Piero FASSINO	Italy
In favour	Ms María FERNÁNDEZ	Spain
In favour	Ms Aurora FLORIDIA	Italy
In favour	Lord George FOULKES	United Kingdom
In favour	Ms Béatrice FRESKO-ROLFO	Monaco
In favour	Mr Pierre-Alain FRIDEZ	Switzerland
In favour	Mr Paul GAVAN	Ireland
In favour	Mr Armen GEVORGYAN	Armenia
In favour	Mr Joël GIRAUD	France
<b>Against</b>	Ms Blerina GJYLAMETI	<mark>Albania</mark>

www.esiweb.org

Voting choice	Member	<u>Country</u>
<mark>Against</mark>	Ms Meryem GÖKA	<mark>Türkiye</mark>
<mark>Against</mark>	Ms Seda GÖREN BÖLÜK	<mark>Türkiye</mark>
In favour	Mr Gustaf GÖTHBERG	Sweden
In favour	Mr Niklaus-Samuel GUGGER	Switzerland
In favour	Mr Antonio GUTIÉRREZ LIMONES	Spain
In favour	Mr Sergio GUTIÉRREZ PRIETO	Spain
In favour	Ms Tuula HAATAINEN	Finland
In favour	Mr Pablo HISPÁN	Spain
In favour	Mr Petri HONKONEN	Finland
In favour	Mr Andrej HUNKO	Germany
In favour	Mr Mogens JENSEN	Denmark
In favour	Mr Bjarni JÓNSSON	Iceland
In favour	Ms Arusyak JULHAKYAN	Armenia
In favour	Ms Marietta KARAMANLI	France
In favour	Mr Claude KERN	France
In favour	Mr Christophe LACROIX	Belgium
In favour	Mr Kristoffer LINDBERG	Sweden
In favour	Mr Reinhold LOPATKA	Austria
In favour	Mr Max LUCKS	Germany
In favour	Mr Saša MAGAZINOVIĆ	Bosnia-Herzegovina
In favour	Ms Luz MARTINEZ SEIJO	Spain
In favour	Ms Isabel MEIRELLES	Portugal
In favour	Ms Anna-Kristiina MIKKONEN	Finland
In favour	Ms Octavie MODERT	Luxembourg
In favour	Ms Marica MONTEMAGGI	San Marino
Abstention	Ms Snježana NOVAKOVIĆ BURSAĆ	Bosnia-Herzegovina
In favour	Mr Joseph O'REILLY	Ireland
In favour	Mr Andrea ORLANDO	Italy
In favour	Mr Berdan ÖZTÜRK	Türkiye
In favour	Ms Valérie PILLER CARRARD	Switzerland
In favour	Ms Agnes Sirkka PRAMMER	Austria
In favour	Ms Catarina ROCHA FERREIRA	Portugal
In favour	Ms Azadeh ROJHAN	Sweden
In favour	Mr Ruben RUBINYAN	Armenia
In favour	Mr Lukas SAVICKAS	Lithuania
In favour	Mr Stefan SCHENNACH	Austria
In favour	Ms Ingjerd Schie SCHOU	Norway
In favour	Mr Frank SCHWABE	Germany
In favour	Ms Lise SELNES	Norway
In favour		France
In favour	Mr Davor Ivo STIER	Croatia
In favour	Ms Liliana TANGUY	France
In favour	Mr Birgir THÓRARINSSON	Iceland

Voting choice	<u>Member</u>	<u>Country</u>
In favour	Ms Beatrice TIMGREN	Sweden
<mark>Against</mark>	Mr Yıldırım Tuğrul TÜRKEŞ	<mark>Türkiye</mark>
In favour	Mr Vladimir VARDANYAN	Armenia
In favour	Ms Susanna VELA	Andorra
In favour	Mr Francesco VERDUCCI	Italy
In favour	Ms Tamara VONTA	Slovenia
In favour	Mr Markus WIECHEL	Sweden
<b>Against</b>	Ms Zeynep YILDIZ	<mark>Türkiye</mark>
<b>Against</b>	Ms Pelin YILIK	<mark>Türkiye</mark>
In favour	Ms Sandra ZAMPA	Italy

#### 19 countries, where NO ONE voted in favour of suspending the Azerbaijani delegation:

Azerbaijan – Estonia – Latvia - Czech Republic - Slovak Republic Hungary – Poland – Bulgaria – Georgia - Moldova Ukraine – Montenegro - North Macedonia - Albania Serbia – Greece – Cyprus – Liechtenstein - Netherlands

#### 11 countries, whose delegations cast the majority of votes in favour of suspension

Iceland – Norway – Switzerland - Luxembourg Austria – Finland – Spain - Portugal Ireland – Monaco - San Marino

#### 3 countries, where the entire delegation voted in favour of suspension

Armenia – Andorra - Sweden



## Those who voted on 24 January: on Azerbaijan's blacklist?

Niklaus-Samuel Gugger

Niklaus-Samuel Gugger, a PACE members from Switzerland, was among those who voted in favor of the suspension of the Azerbaijani delegation on 24 January 2024.

On 5 February 2024, he travelled to Baku as an OSCE-accredited election observer. He was denied to enter Azerbaijan and was held at the airport for three hours, his passport was confiscated, and he was then escorted by the police and put on the next plane to Istanbul. Only there did he finally get his diplomatic passport back.<sup>7</sup>

In an interview he mentioned that during the call with Azerbaijani Ambassador to Switzerland, the Ambassador mentioned that the blacklisting is due to his involvement in PACE. Niklaus Samuel-Gugger confirmed: "I ended up on a black list".<sup>8</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> <u>https://www.blick.ch/politik/eklat-bei-osze-mission-einreise-verweigert-pass-beschlagnahmt-drei-stunden-am-flughafen-in-baku-festgehalten-aserbaidschan-diktator-wirft-schweizer-nationalrat-aus-dem-land-id19399361.html?fbclid=IwAR0IwR0UFT9o7W0U0nQ9apdaSL\_FLZo9XHrMeTB9YwXvMuxBeHobM4BVZ lc</u>

<sup>8</sup> https://www.srf.ch/news/schweiz/ausweisung-aus-aserbaidschan-nik-gugger-ich-bin-auf-einer-schwarzen-listegelandet